

Total Score		Recommendation		Review Round	
-------------	--	----------------	--	--------------	--

Manuscript Title	
Primary Reviewer	
Secondary Reviewer	
Faculty Advisor	

Instructions: Provide a score from 0 to 5 points per item.

- 5 – Highly developed; compelling and well written; thorough; consistently formatted.
- 4 – Needs only minor revisions; sufficiently written and developed; rarely vague or confusing; very few inconsistencies.
- 3 – Needs moderate revisions and/or further development, but still mostly clear to reader; occasionally vague, confusing, or inconsistent.
- 2 – Needs some major revisions and/or to be much more developed; raises major questions for reader; often confusing, misleading, or inconsistent.
- 1 – Under-developed; needs sweeping revisions or possible rewrite; leaves reader with more questions than answers; confusing, misleading, or inconsistent throughout.
- 0 – Item is missing.

ABSTRACT

Assessment Item	Score
Is the research question clearly articulated?	
Is the research approach/method clearly defined?	
Does the author make clear the results/relevance of this research?	

Comments
Please explain your scoring and how the author can improve.

BODY OF ARTICLE

Assessment Item	Score
Does the author clearly state the research question and explain its real-world significance?	
Does the author provide sufficient background information on the issue; enough to establish his/her position for the reader? (Literature, defining terms, etc.)	
Does the author make clear why this research is needed and/or its potential contribution to its field?	
Does the author thoroughly explain the material(s) and method(s) used to answer the question?	
Does the author explain the methodology?	
Are the research results explicitly stated and thorough?	
Does the author make explicit how these results relate to the original research question(s)?	
Is there a thorough discussion of the findings? <ul style="list-style-type: none">• What do the findings indicate?• Was there anything unexpected?• Are there any other possible interpretations?	
Does the author convey the implications and impact of these findings?	
Does the author related to other work and/or and suggest possible directions for further study?	

Comments

Please explain your scoring and how the author can improve.

REFERENCES AND CITATIONS

Assessment Item	Score
Has the author compiled a relevant and sufficient list of references?	
Are the references and citations formatted correctly to the discipline?	

Comments
Please explain your scoring and how the author can improve.

OVERALL

Assessment Item	Score
Overall, please rate the author's use of grammar and spelling.	
Overall, please rate the clarity of the argument being developed.	
Overall, please rate the author's use of in-text citations.	
Overall, does the author convince you that his/her question and results are significant?	
Overall, do you feel that the article was successful?	

Comments
Please explain your scoring and how the author can improve the article.

Totals:

Abstract Score	
Body Score	
Reference Score	
Overall Score	
Total Score (also at top)	

JUSTIFICATION FOR RECOMMENDATION

--